

TEMPLATE FOR SENDING COMMENTS ON BIS DOCUMENTS (P- Drafts)

1. TITLE: *Snuhi (Euphorbia nerifolia* Linn.) Stem for use in Traditional Medicine – Specification

LAST DATE OF COMMENTS: **27.10.2023**

Sl. No.	Clause/Sub-clause/para/table/figure No. commented	Commentator/ Organization/ Abbreviation	Type of Comments (General/ Editorial/ Technical)	Justification	Proposed change	Observation of BIS secretariat	Recommendation of committee
1	1 Scope	Dr. Anagha Ranade	Technical	Ideally, In Ayurveda, the latex and whole plant has been denoted in many formulations and not the stem.		The present document provides specifications for the Snuhi stem based on data available in the Ayurveda Pharmacopeia of India. At present the pharmacopeial publication contains monograph on Snuhi stem only, while other parts of this plant may require some separate standards.	The committee agreed with the observation.
2	3.1.1	Dr. Anagha Ranade	Technical	As per classics, <i>Euphorbia nerifolia</i> is botanical source for patra snuhi. Thus, leaf can be useful part apart		Same as 1 above	The committee agreed with the observation.

				from latex for this plant but not specifically stem.			
3	4.1	Dr. Anagha Ranade	Technical	<p>Some instructions must be given during collection as some ocular problems, skin rashes may occur due to the latex content. Also, snuhi latex is a part of E1 schedule, upavisha varga.</p> <p>The collection protocol for snuhi latex has been given in charak samhita kalpasthan wherein the procedure, time of collection and maturity of plant has been denoted.</p>		The comment has been accepted and necessary information will be included in the document.	The committee agreed to accept this comment and necessary information will be included in the document.
4	4.3	Dr. Anagha Ranade	Technical	All the dosage forms and formulations mentioned separately in Charak samhita kalpasthan 10 possess latex only.		<p>The document exclusively provides specification for the Snuhi stem based on data from the Ayurveda Pharmacopoeia. A separate standard may be required for latex and other parts.</p> <p>The Shodhana procedure of</p>	The committee agreed with the observation.

				Shodhana protocol denoted in API and classics is applicable for snuhi ksheera i.e latex only.		Schedule E1 drugs will be covered under the separate standard proposed for future work.	
5	Page 1	Dr.Arya Sethuparvat hy	Technical	The botanical name should be changed as Euphorbia neriifolia L. as per the new INCI nomenclature	The botanical name should be changed as Euphorbia neriifolia L. as per the new INCI nomenclature	The comment is accepted and necessary correction will be done in the document.	The committee agreed to accept this comment and revise the botanical name as per new INCI nomenclature.

2. TITLE: *Krishnajiraka (Carum carvi Linn.)* Fruit for use in Traditional Medicine – Specification

LAST DATE OF COMMENTS: 30.10.2023

Sl. No.	Clause/Sub-clause/para/table/figure No. commented	Commentator/ Organization/ Abbreviation	Type of Comments (General/Editorial/Technical)	Justification	Proposed change	Observation of BIS secretariat	Recommendation of committee
1	3.1	Dr. Anagha Ranade	Technical		(Family: Apiaceae as per new nomenclature)	The comment is accepted and updated family name as per new nomenclature will	The committee agreed to accept this comment and revised family name will be added in the document.

						be added in the document.	
2	3.2	Dr. Anagha Ranade	Technical		Can we add names of common adulterants with botanical sources?	The comment is accepted and names of common adulterants with botanical sources will be included in the document.	The committee agreed to accept the comment and include the names of common adulterants with botanical sources in the document.
3	3.2.2	Dr. Anagha Ranade	Technical		An authentic image may be added. Test may be specified for confirmation	The comment is not acceptable as the images related to image of authentic drug are not available in any Pharmacopeial publications. Any addition in the pharmacopeia will be included in subsequent revisions of this Indian standard.	The committee agreed with the observation as the images related to image of authentic drug are not available in any Pharmacopeial publications.
4	4.1	Dr. Anagha Ranade	Technical		Can we add season of collection as per classics?	The comment is accepted and season of collection as per classics will be added in the document.	The committee agreed to accept the comment and season of collection as per classics will be added in the document if available in authentic sources.
5	Page 1	Dr. Anagha Ranade	Technical		In case of Sanskrit synonyms of krishnajiraka,	The comment is not acceptable since the synonyms and	The committee agreed with the observation.

					there is a need to specify from which classical text it has been taken. In case of jeeraka, there are multiple opinions regarding upakunchika/karvi/pruthvika which are referred to as different botanical sources in some text.	vernacular names mentioned in the pharmacopeial publications have been given in the document.	
6	Page 1	Dr. Rajiva Kumar Rai	General	Can we add a line for common adulterants? Fruits of <i>Bunium persicum</i> (Family Apiaceae) also known as Shah-zirah/Kala Zira and sometimes coloured cumin (Jeera) fruits (<i>Cuminum cyminum</i> – Family Apiaceae) are found mixed with <i>Carum carvi</i> fruits.	Fruits of <i>Bunium persicum</i> (Family Apiaceae) also known as Shah-zirah/Kala Zira and sometimes coloured cumin (Jeera) fruits (<i>Cuminum cyminum</i> – Family Apiaceae) are found mixed with <i>Carum carvi</i> fruits.	The comment is accepted and information related to common adulterants will be added in the document.	The committee agreed to accept the comment and information related to common adulterants will be added in the document.

7	Page 1	Dr. Rahul S. Gandhi	General	Tranliteration rules may be adopted for non-English terms esp. Sanskrit for easy and accurate pronunciation and apprehension	Krishnajiraka is misspelt at atleast 2 places i.e. foreword - 1st para and page 2 title	The comment is accepted and corrections will be made in the document.	The committee agreed to accept the comment and necessary corrections will be made in the document.
---	--------	---------------------	---------	--	---	---	--

3. TITLE: *Kushtha (Saussurea lappa C.B. Clarke)* Root for use in Traditional Medicine – Specification

LAST DATE OF COMMENTS: 30.10.2023

Sl. No.	Clause/Sub-clause/para/table/fig. No. commented	Commentator/ Organization/ Abbreviation	Type of Comments (General/ Editorial/ Technical)	Justification	Proposed change	Observation of BIS secretariat	Recommendation of committee
1	1 Scope	Dr. Anagha Ranade	Technical		Family: Asteraceae	The comment is accepted and the updated family name will be added in the document.	The committee agreed to accept the comment and the updated family name will be added in the document.

2	3.2	Dr. Anagha Ranade	Technical		Some confirmatory tests must be included. image of authentic drug may be included.	The comment is not acceptable as the images related to image of authentic drug are not available in any Pharmacopeial publications. Any additions made to the pharmacopeia will be incorporated into subsequent revisions of this Indian Standard.	The committee agreed with the observation.
3	4	Dr. Anagha Ranade	Technical		Time of collection as per Ayurveda can be added	The comment is accepted and the time of collection as per Ayurveda will be included in the document.	The committee agreed to accept the comment and the time of collection as per Ayurveda will be included in the document.
4	In page no. 1 – under Foreword heading	Dr. Rajiva Kumar Rai	Technical	It is mentioned that species is found in Kashmir whereas it is also found in Himachal Pradesh and little bit cultivation in Uttarakhand as well.	Kushtha is a tall, robust, perennial herb with thick roots, found in Kashmir, Himachal Pradesh and in Uttarakhand at an altitude of 2500 to 3600 m. Roots are collected between	The comment is accepted and necessary correction will be done in the document.	The committee agreed to accept the comment and necessary correction will be done in the document.

					September to October. Dried roots of the plant are used as ingredient of formulations in traditional Indian systems of medicine.		
5	Page 1 under heading Scope	Dr. Rajiva Kumar Rai	Technical	Dried aromatic fruits is mentioned as used part whereas used part is Root. However, in all other places it is mentioned as Roots	This standard prescribes the requirements and methods of test for Kushtha which consists of dried aromatic roots of Saussurea lappa C.B. Clarke (Family Compositae).	The comment is accepted and necessary correction will be done in the document.	The committee agreed to accept the comment and necessary correction will be done in the document.
6	Page 1	Dr. Rajiva Kumar Rai	General	Can we add a line for some common adulterants - Saussurea lappa – Roots of Carduus nutans (Musk-thistle, Family Asteraceae), Inula racemose (Pushkarmool – Family Asteraceae) and Arctium lappa (Jangli	Commonly found adulterants - Roots of Carduus nutans (Musk-thistle, Family Asteraceae), Inula racemose (Pushkarmool – Family	The comment is accepted and information related to some common adulterants will be added in the document.	The committee agreed to accept the comment and information related to common adulterants will be added in the document.

				Kuth - Family Asteraceae) are sometime found mixed with the Kuth roots.	Asteraceae) and Arcticum lappa (Jangli Kuth - Family Asteraceae) are sometime found mixed with the Kuth roots.		
--	--	--	--	---	--	--	--

4. TITLE: *Kulattha [Vigna unguiculata (Linn.) Walp.] Seed for use in Traditional Medicine – Specification*

LAST DATE OF COMMENTS: **30.10.2023**

Sl. No.	Clause/Sub-clause/para/table/fig. No. commented	Commentator/ Organization / Abbreviation	Type of Comments (General/ Editorial/ Technical)	Justification	Proposed change	Observation of BIS secretariat	Recommendation of committee
1	1	Dr. Rajiva Kumar Rai	Technical	LOD parameter is missing. Whereas we know that higher percentage of moisture content in any RM may cause microbial growth during transport and storage. Even higher moisture content in RM sometime can give	LOD NMT	The comment is not acceptable as the Data related to the same is not available in any Pharmacopeial publications. Any addition in the pharmacopeia will be included in	The committee agreed with the observation.

				different analytical results.		subsequent revisions of this Indian standard.	
2	Table 1	Dr. Rajiva Kumar Rai	Technical	Limit for Foreign Matter is shown as Nil. Generally under stem bark category we have 2% limit.	Foreign Material - NMT 2% W/W	The comment is not acceptable as here seed of the plant is being used and as per Ayurvedic Pharmacopeia the limit for foreign matter is Nil.	The committee agreed to accept the comment and correction will be done in the document.
3	Table 1	Dr. Rajiva Kumar Rai	Technical	Volatile oil to be removed from the parameters list of the specification.	Volatile oil to be removed from the parameters list of the specification.	The comment is accepted and necessary correction will be done in the document.	The committee agreed to accept the comment and correction will be done in the document.

5. TITLE: *Kiratatikta (Swertia chirata Buch.Ham.) - Whole Plant use in Traditional Medicine – Specification*

LAST DATE OF COMMENTS: **30.10.2023**

Sl. No.	Clause/Sub-clause/para/table/figure No. commented	Commentator/ Organization/ Abbreviation	Type of Comments (General/ Editorial/ Technical)	Justification	Proposed change	Observation of BIS secretariat	Recommendation of committee
1	1	Dr. Rajiva Kumar Rai	Technical	LOD parameter is missing. Whereas we know that higher percentage of moisture content in any RM may	LOD NMT	The comment is not acceptable as the Data related to the same is not available in any Pharmacopeial	The committee agreed with the observation.

				cause microbial growth during transport and storage. Even higher moisture content in RM sometime can give different analytical results.		publications. Any addition in the pharmacopeia will be included in subsequent revisions of this Indian standard.	
2	Table 1	Dr. Anagha Ranade	General	Acid insoluble ash mentioned does not co- incide with API value		The comment is accepted and Necessary correction will be done in the document.	The committee agreed to accept the comment and correction will be done in the document.

6. TITLE: *Karanja [Pongamia pinnata Linn. (Merr)] Seed for use in Traditional Medicine – Specification*

LAST DATE OF COMMENTS: **31.10.2023**

Sl. No .	Clause/Sub-clause/ para/table/fig. No. commented	Commentator/ Organization / Abbreviation	Type of Comments (General/ Editorial/ Technical)	Justification	Proposed change	Observation of BIS secretariat	Recommendation of committee
1	1	Dr. Rajiva Kumar Rai	Technical	LOD parameter is missing. Whereas we know that higher percentage of moisture content in any RM may cause microbial growth during transport and storage. Even higher moisture content in RM sometime can give different analytical results.	LOD NMT	The comment is not acceptable as the Data related to the same is not available in Any Pharmacopeial publications. Any addition in the pharmacopeia will be included in subsequent revisions of this Indian standard.	The committee agreed with the observation.

2	3.2	Dr. Anagha Ranade	General	In classical literature, parts used are leaves , bark apart from seeds.		This document provides specific requirements for the Karanja [<i>Pongamia pinnata</i> Linn. (Merr)] Seed based on the data available in Pharmacopeias'. Other parts of the plant may have separate standards.	The committee agreed with the observation.
---	-----	-------------------	---------	---	--	--	--

7. TITLE: *Kanchanara (Bauhinia variegata* Blume) Stem bark for use in Traditional Medicine – Specification

LAST DATE OF COMMENTS: **31.10.2023**

Sl. No	Clause/Sub-clause/para/table/fig. No. commented	Commentator/ Organization / Abbreviation	Type of Comments (General/ Editorial/ Technical)	Justification	Proposed change	Observation of BIS secretariat	Recommendation of committee
--------	---	--	---	---------------	-----------------	--------------------------------	-----------------------------

1	1	Dr. Rajiva Kumar Rai	Technical	LOD parameter is missing. Whereas we know that higher percentage of moisture content in any RM may cause microbial growth during transport and storage. Even higher moisture content in RM sometime can give different analytical results.	LOD NMT	The comment is not acceptable as the Data related to the same is not available in any Pharmacopeial publications. Any addition in the pharmacopeia will be included in subsequent revisions of this Indian standard.	The committee agreed with the observation.
2	Page 1	Dr. Anagha Ranade	Technical		The new name for family is fabaceae – Caesalpinoidea Also, can we add the time of collection as per classics?	The comment is accepted and updated family name will be added in the document. The time of collection as per classics will be included from the classical texts.	The committee agreed to accept the comment and updated family name will be corrected in the document.

8. TITLE: *Kankola (Piper cubeba Linn.f) Fruit for use in Traditional Medicine Specification*

LAST DATE OF COMMENTS: 31.10.2023

Sl. No.	Clause/Sub-clause/para/table/figure No. commented	Commentator/ Organization/ Abbreviation	Type of Comments (General/ Editorial/ Technical)	Justification	Proposed change	Observation of BIS secretariat	Recommendation of committee
1	1	Dr. Rajiva Kumar Rai	Technical	LOD parameter is missing. Whereas we know that higher percentage of moisture content in any RM may cause microbial growth during transport and storage. Even higher moisture content in RM sometime can give different analytical results.	LOD NMT	The comment is not acceptable as the Data related to the same is not available in any Pharmacopeial publications. Any addition in the pharmacopeia will be included in subsequent revisions of this Indian standard.	The committee agreed with the observation.
2	4.2	Dr. Anagha Ranade	General	We may add the classical collection timing as per Ayurveda	We may add the classical	The comment is accepted and classical collection timing	The committee agreed to accept the comment and collection time will be added in the document if available in authentic sources.

					collection timing as per Ayurveda	will be added in the document from the authentic source.	
--	--	--	--	--	-----------------------------------	--	--

9. TITLE: *Ketaki* (Pandanus tectorius Soland.ex Parkinson) – Root for use in Traditional Medicine – Specification

LAST DATE OF COMMENTS: 31.10.2023

Sl. No.	Clause/Sub-clause/para/table/figure No. commented	Commentator/ Organization/ Abbreviation	Type of Comments (General/ Editorial/ Technical)	Justification	Proposed change	Observation of BIS secretariat	Recommendation of committee
1	1	Dr. Rajiva Kumar Rai	Technical	LOD parameter is missing. Whereas we know that higher percentage of moisture content in any RM may cause microbial growth during transport and storage. Even higher moisture content in RM sometime can give different analytical results.	LOD NMT	The comment is not acceptable as the Data related to the same is not available in any pharmacopeial publications. Any addition in the pharmacopeia will be included in subsequent revisions of this Indian standard.	The committee agreed with the observation.

2	3.2.1	Dr. Anagha Ranade	Technical	Any confirmatory test for Artificial Flavours	Any confirmatory test for Artificial Flavours	The comment is accepted and confirmatory test for Artificial Flavours will be included if available from any authentic sources.	
3	4.2	Dr. Anagha Ranade	General	We may add the classical collection timing as per Ayurveda	We may add the classical collection timing as per Ayurveda	The comment is accepted and classical collection timing will be added in the document from the authentic source.	The committee agreed to accept the comment and collection time will be added in the document.

10. TITLE: Svetajiraka (*Cuminum cyminum* Linn.) Fruit use in Traditional Medicine – Specification

LAST DATE OF COMMENTS: 31.10.2023

Sl. No.	Clause/Sub-clause/para/table/figure No. commented	Commentator/ Organization/ Abbreviation	Type of Comments (General/ Editorial/ Technical)	Justification	Proposed change	Observation of BIS secretariat	Recommendation of committee
1	1	Dr. Rajiva Kumar Rai	Technical	LOD parameter is missing. Whereas we know that higher	LOD NMT	The comment is not acceptable as the Data related	The committee agreed with the observation.

				percentage of moisture content in any RM may cause microbial growth during transport and storage. Even higher moisture content in RM sometime can give different analytical results.		to the same is not available in any Pharmacopeial publications. Any addition in the pharmacopeia will be included in subsequent revisions of this Indian standard.	
2	Table 1	Dr. Dinesh Bisht	Technical	<p>The values in table 1 for the following may be considered as per FSSAI.</p> <p>(ii) Total ash, percent by mass, Max 8.0</p> <p>(iii) Acid insoluble ash, percent by mass, Max 1.0</p> <p>(vi) Volatile oil, percent by mass, Min =?</p> <p>vii) Aflatoxin (B1), ng/kg Max 2.0</p> <p>viii) Aflatoxin (B1+B2+G1+G2), ng/kg, Max 5.0</p> <p>The values are very stringent with respect to Aflatoxins.</p>	<p>Suggestions:</p> <p>The values in table 1 for the following may be considered as per FSSAI.</p> <p>(ii) Total ash, percent by mass, Max 9.5</p> <p>(iii) Acid insoluble ash, percent by mass, Max 3.0</p> <p>(vi) Volatile oil, percent by mass, Min 1.5</p> <p>vii) Aflatoxin (B1), ng/kg, ug/kg, Max 20.0</p>	<p>The comment is not acceptable. As the document specifies requirements of the herb for its use in traditional medicine, limits prescribed in the documents are derived by harmonizing pharmacopeias related to Ayurveda, Siddha and Unani systems of Medicine.</p>	<p>The committee agreed with the observation.</p>

					viii) Aflatoxin (B1+B2+G1+G2), ug/kg, Max 30.0		
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

11. TITLE: *Kutaja (Holarrhena antidysenterica (Roth) A. DC.) - Stem bark for use in Traditional Medicine – Specification*

LAST DATE OF COMMENTS: 31.10.2023

Sl. No.	Clause/Sub-clause/para/table/figure No. commented	Commentator/ Organization/ Abbreviation	Type of Comments (General/ Editorial/ Technical)	Justification	Proposed change	Observation of BIS secretariat	Recommendation of committee
1	1	Dr. Rajiva Kumar Rai	Technical	LOD parameter is missing. Whereas we know that higher percentage of moisture content in any RM may cause microbial growth during transport and storage. Even higher moisture content in RM sometime can give	LOD NMT	The comment is not acceptable as the Data related to the same is not available in Any Pharmacopeial publications. Any addition in the pharmacopeia will be included in subsequent revisions of this Indian standard.	The committee agreed with the observation.

				different analytical results.			
2	Page 1	Dr. Rajiva Kumar Rai	Technical	Collection of Stem Bark is mentioned during "Mid of rainy season (July to September)". As per Good Collection Practices, bark should be collected during "November to February". However, this is general practice and there may be some variation depending on species.	Collection of Bark to be done preferably during November to February	The comment is accepted and Time period for collection of the bark will be added in the document.	The committee agreed to accept the comment and time period for collection of bark will be added in the document.
3	Table 1	Dr. Rajiva Kumar Rai	Technical	Volatile oil to be removed from the parameters list of the specification.	Volatile oil to be removed from the parameters list of the specification.	The comment is accepted and necessary correction will be done in the document.	The committee agreed to accept the comment and correction will be done in the document.
4	Table 1 (Values of Point i, ii, iii, iv, and v)	Dr. Anagha Ranade	Technical	These values does not match with the values given in API	These values does not match with the values given in API	The comment is accepted and value as per API will be added in the document.	The committee agreed to accept the comment and values as per API will be added in the document.

12. TITLE: *Lavanga (Syzygium aromaticum (Linn.) Merr. & L.M. Perry Flower Bud for use in Traditional Medicine – Specification*

LAST DATE OF COMMENTS: 31.10.2023

Sl. No.	Clause/Sub-clause/para/table/figure No. commented	Commentator/ Organization/ Abbreviation	Type of Comments (General/ Editorial/ Technical)	Justification	Proposed change	Observation of BIS secretariat	Recommendation of committee
1	1	Dr. Rajiva Kumar Rai	Technical	LOD parameter is missing. Whereas we know that higher percentage of moisture content in any RM may cause microbial growth during transport and storage. Even higher moisture content in RM sometime can give different analytical results.	LOD NMT	The comment is not acceptable as the Data related to the same is not available in any Pharmacopeial publications. Any addition in the pharmacopeia will be included in subsequent revisions of this Indian standard.	The committee agreed with the observation.
2	3.2.1	Dr. Anagha Ranade	Technical	Any confirmatory test for Artificial Flavours	Any confirmatory test for Artificial Flavours	The comment is accepted and confirmatory test for Artificial Flavours will be included if available from	The committee agreed with the observation and recommended to add confirmatory test if available in authentic source.

						any authentic sources.	
3	Table 1	Dr. Dinesh Bisht	Technical	<p>The values in table 1 for the following may be considered as per FSSAI.</p> <p>(vi) Volatile oil, percent by mass, Min 15</p> <p>vii) Aflatoxin (B1), ng/kg, Max 2.0</p> <p>viii) Aflatoxin (B1+B2+G1+G2), ng/kg, Max 5.0</p> <p>The values are very stringent with respect to Aflatoxins.</p>	<p>Suggestions:</p> <p>The values in table 1 for the following may be considered as per FSSAI.</p> <p>(vi) Volatile oil, percent by mass, Min 16.0</p> <p>vii) Aflatoxin (B1), ng/kg, ug/kg, Max 20.0</p> <p>viii) Aflatoxin (B1+B2+G1+G2), ug/kg, Max 30.0</p>	<p>The comment is not acceptable. As the document specifies requirements of the herb for its use in traditional medicine, limits prescribed in the documents are derived by harmonizing pharmacopeias related to Ayurveda, Siddha and Unani systems of Medicine.</p>	<p>The committee agreed with the observation.</p>

13. TITLE: *Lodhra (Symlocos racemosa Roxb.)* Stem bark for use in Traditional Medicine – Specification

LAST DATE OF COMMENTS: 31.10.2023

Sl. No.	Clause/Sub-clause/para/table/figure No. commented	Commentator/ Organization/ Abbreviation	Type of Comments (General/ Editorial/ Technical)	Justification	Proposed change	Observation of BIS secretariat	Recommendation of committee
1	1	Dr. Rajiva Kumar Rai	Technical	LOD parameter is missing. Whereas we know that higher percentage of moisture content in any RM may cause microbial growth during transport and storage. Even higher moisture content in RM sometime can give different analytical results.	LOD NMT	The comment is not acceptable as the data related to the same is not available in any Pharmacopeial publications. Any addition in the pharmacopeia will be included in subsequent revisions of this Indian standard.	The committee agreed with the observation.
2	Table 1	Dr. Rajiva Kumar Rai	Technical	Limit for Foreign Matter is shown as Nil. Generally under stem bark category we have 2% limit.	Foreign Material - NMT 2% W/W	The comment is accepted and necessary correction will be done in the document.	The committee agreed to accept the comment and correction will be done in the document.

3	3.1.1	Dr. Anagha Ranade	Technical	Word "Fiat" is highlighted	Word "Fiat" needs to be checked	The comment is accepted and necessary correction will be done in the document.	The committee agreed to accept the comment and correction will be done in the document.
4	4	Dr. Anagha Ranade	General	Collection time as per Ayurveda may be added	Collection time as per Ayurveda may be added	The comment is accepted and Collection time may be added from authentic source.	The committee agreed to accept the comment and Collection time as per Ayurveda will be added from authentic source.

14. TITLE: *Shathi (Hedychium spicatum* Ham.ex Smith.) Rhizome for use in Traditional Medicine – Specification

LAST DATE OF COMMENTS: 6.11.2023

Sl. No.	Clause/Sub-clause/para/table/figure No. commented	Commentator/ Organization/ Abbreviation	Type of Comments (General/ Editorial/ Technical)	Justification	Proposed change	Observation of BIS secretariat	Recommendation of committee
1	1	Dr. Rajiva Kumar Rai	Technical	"Dried ripe fruits of the plant are not used as ingredients".	"Dried ripe rhizomes of the plant are used as ingredients".	The comment is accepted and necessary correction will be done in the document.	The committee agreed to accept the comment and correction will be done in the document.

2	1	Dr. Rajiva Kumar Rai	Technical	It is mentioned that "Cultivated as cold season crop in plains of India"	This needs to be verified and corrected as this species is found in entire Himalayan Region (sub-tropical to Temperate) not in plains of India.	The comment is accepted and necessary correction will be done in the document.	The committee agreed to accept the comment and correction will be done in the document.
3	Page 1	Dr. Anagha Ranade	Technical	<i>Shathi</i> shall be changed to " <i>Shati</i> "	<i>Shathi</i> shall be changed to " <i>Shati</i> "	The comment is accepted and necessary correction will be done in the document.	The committee agreed to accept the comment and correction will be done in the document.

15. TITLE: *Patha (Cissampelos pareira Linn.)* Root for use in Traditional Medicine – Specification

LAST DATE OF COMMENTS: 6.11.2023

Sl. No.	Clause/Sub-clause/para/table/figure No. commented	Commentator/ Organization/ Abbreviation	Type of Comments (General/ Editorial/ Technical)	Justification	Proposed change	Observation of BIS secretariat	Recommendation of committee
1	1	Dr. Rajiva Kumar Rai	Technical	Root is mentioned as used part.	However, aerial portion (Stem and Leaves) are also used extensively. Along with root, leaves and stem should also be added as used part	This document provides specific requirements for the <i>Patha (Cissampelos pareira Linn.)</i> root and focus solely on the specification of the root. However, other parts of the plant may have separate standards that outline specific criteria for those parts.	The committee agreed with the observation.

16. TITLE: *Mishreya (Foeniculum vulgare Mill.)* Fruit for use in Traditional Medicine – Specification

LAST DATE OF COMMENTS: 6.11.2023

Sl. No.	Clause/Sub-clause/para/table/figure No. commented	Commentator/ Organization/ Abbreviation	Type of Comments (General/ Editorial/ Technical)	Justification	Proposed change	Observation of BIS secretariat	Recommendation of committee
1	5.2 Table 1	Dr. Dinesh Bisht	Technical	<p>The values in table 1 for the following may be considered as per FSSAI.</p> <p>(ii) Total ash, percent by mass, Max 12.0</p> <p>(iii) Acid insoluble ash, percent by mass, Max 15.0</p> <p>(vi) Volatile oil, percent by mass, Min 1.4</p> <p>vii) Aflatoxin (B1), ng/kg, ng/kg, Max 2.0</p> <p>viii) Aflatoxin (B1+B2+G1+G2), ng/kg, Max 5.0</p>	<p>The values in table 1 for the following may be considered as per FSSAI.</p> <p>(ii) Total ash, percent by mass, Max 10.0</p> <p>(iii) Acid insoluble ash, percent by mass, Max 2.0</p> <p>(vi) Volatile oil, percent by mass, Min 1.0</p> <p>vii) Aflatoxin (B1), ng/kg,</p>	<p>The comment is not acceptable. As the document specifies requirements of the herb for its use in traditional medicine, limits prescribed in the documents are derived by harmonizing pharmacopeias related to Ayurveda, Siddha and Unani systems of Medicine.</p>	<p>The committee agreed with the observation.</p>

				The values are very stringent in terms of MLs for Aflatoxins	ug/kg, Max 20.0 viii) Aflatoxin (B1+B2+G1+G2), ug/kg, Max 30.0		
2	1	Dr. Anagha Ranade	Technical	New name of Family "Apiaceae"	Family name to be changed to "Apiaceae" from "Umbelliferae"	The comment is accepted and the family name will be changed in the document.	The committee agreed to accept the comment and family name will be updated in the document.

17. TITLE: *Nyagrodha (Ficus bengalensis* Linn.) Stem Bark for use in Traditional Medicine – Specification

LAST DATE OF COMMENTS: 6.11.2023

Sl. No.	Clause/Sub-clause/para/table/figure No. commented	Commentator/ Organization/ Abbreviation	Type of Comments (General/ Editorial/ Technical)	Justification	Proposed change	Observation of BIS secretariat	Recommendation of committee
1	Foreword	Dr. Anagha Ranade	Technical	Apart from stem bark, aerial roots (vatankura) are also used in Ayurveda. The	Apart from stem bark, aerial roots (vatankura) are	The document provides specification for the <i>Nyagrodha (Ficus</i>	The committee agreed with the observation.

				standards for the same can be prepared/added if possible.	also used in Ayurveda. The standards for the same can be prepared/added if possible.	<i>bengalensis</i> Linn.) Stem Bark based on the data available in Pharmacopeial publications. A separate standard may be required for aerial roots (vatankura) and other parts.	
--	--	--	--	---	--	--	--

18. TITLE: *Pashanabheda* [*Bergenia ciliata* (Haw.) Sternb.] Rhizome for use in Traditional Medicine – Specification

LAST DATE OF COMMENTS: 6.11.2023

Sl. No.	Clause/Sub-clause/para/table/figure No. commented	Commentator/ Organization/ Abbreviation	Type of Comments (General/ Editorial/ Technical)	Justification	Proposed change	Observation of BIS secretariat	Recommendation of committee
1	Page 1	Dr. Anagha Ranade	Technical	Asmahedaka should be corrected to "Ashmabhedaka"	Asmahedaka should be corrected to "Ashmabhedaka"	The comment is accepted and the name will be corrected in the document.	The committee agreed to accept the comment and name will be corrected in the document.

19. TITLE: *Puga (Areca catechu* Linn.) Seed for use in Traditional Medicine – Specification

LAST DATE OF COMMENTS: 6.11.2023

Sl. No.	Clause/Sub-clause/para/table/figure No. commented	Commentator/ Organization/ Abbreviation	Type of Comments (General/ Editorial/ Technical)	Justification	Proposed change	Observation of BIS secretariat	Recommendation of committee
1	Page 2	Dr. Anagha Ranade	Technical	Family Name "Palmae" can also be written as Arecaceae	Family Name "Palmae" can also be written as Arecaceae	The comment is accepted and necessary correction will be done in the document.	The committee agreed to accept the comment and correction will be done in the document.